

More

News, Quotes, Companies, Videos

SEARCH

Thursday, September 23, 2010 New York 78° | 69

OPINION JOURNAL

U.S. Edition Home Today's Paper Video Blogs Journal Community

Log In

GET 2 WEEKS FREE SUBSCRIBE NOW!

▶ THE PRINT JOURNAL

▶ THE ONLINE JOURNAL

World U.S. New York Business Markets Tech Personal Finance Life & Culture Opinion Careers Real Estate Small Business

Leisure & Arts Letters to the Editor Political Diary Columns

TOP STORIES IN Opinion



John C. Goodman: How Seniors Will Pay...

Too Little Inflation?

Shakedown in the Rain Forest

Ja Af

OPINION | SEPTEMBER 23, 2010

How Seniors Will Pay for ObamaCare

In many areas, Medicare Advantage enrollees will lose about one-third of their health insurance benefits. The cuts will finance new subsidies for younger people.

Article

Comments (97)

MORE IN OPINION »

Email Print Save This Like 74 + More Text

By JOHN C. GOODMAN

Today marks the six-month anniversary of the enactment of the Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act, widely known as ObamaCare. It is a day when the first significant round of benefits kicks in, and the Obama administration is taking every opportunity to tout them to the American public.

Insurers, we are being told, will no longer be able to impose annual limits or lifetime caps on benefits, and they will face a higher standard before than can drop anyone's coverage. Children will be guaranteed access to insurance, regardless of health condition. And there is more to come in the future.

Yet the administration is strangely silent about who will bear the cost of these benefits. Search the government's own health-reform website and you'll get the idea that the whole thing is one big free lunch.



View Full Image

Chad Crowe

The reality is that the cost of ObamaCare will be quite high for some people. By 2017, thousands of people in Dallas, Houston and San Antonio will be paying more than \$5,000 a year in lost health-care benefits to make ObamaCare possible, according to a study published this month by Robert Book at the Heritage Foundation and James Capretta at the Ethics and Public Policy Center. For some New York City dwellers, the figure will exceed \$6,000 a year. Unfortunate residents of Ascension, La., will pay more than \$9,000

in lost benefits.

Who are these people? Are they the rich and the comfortable—the folks presidential candidate Barack Obama told us could afford to pay for health reform? Are they people who have excessively profited during a recession that's caused hardships for so many? Are they the ones who gained the most from the Bush tax cuts?

None of the above. According to the Book/Capretta study, the people getting hit with these very expensive tabs live in predominately low-income households. They are disproportionately minorities. They have trouble paying their own medical bills.

These are the enrollees in Medicare Advantage plans, health plans operated by private insurers (Cigna, Aetna, United Health, etc.) that provide extra benefits to the elderly and the disabled on top of standard Medicare coverage. The price they will pay for health reform will be a double whammy: less spending on Medicare coupled with reduced subsidies for their Medicare Advantage plans. In many areas, Medicare Advantage enrollees will lose about one-third or more of their health-insurance benefits.

REPLAY

It's time to ask smarter questions.

Let's build a smarter planet.

Click here for more IBM Security solutions »

WSJ.com Expand your access to WSJ.com

It only takes a moment

Click here to unlock your FREE access to more newsletters, alerts and key analysis

CLICK HERE

Most Popular on Facebook

- Facebook CEO Zuckerberg to Donate \$100 Million to Newark Schools - WSJ.com
1,168 people shared this.
- John Fund: The Carter-Obama Comparisons Grow - WSJ.com
3,323 people shared this.
- Abbott Recalls Similac Baby Powdered Formula - WSJ.com
338 people shared this.
- Celebrities Auction Tweets to Raise Money for Haitian Orphans - WSJ.com
119 people shared this.
- Advice for University of Chicago Professor Todd Henderson - WSJ.com
325 people shared this.

Facebook social plugin

Video

Despite its popularity, conventional Medicare is actually a lousy health-insurance plan. It doesn't cover most drugs and it leaves beneficiaries exposed to thousands of dollars in potential out-of-pocket expenses. To protect themselves, most seniors purchase additional coverage known as "Medigap" insurance (either from an employer or purchased directly) and buy drug coverage (Medicare Part D) as well.

Many low-income seniors, however, have trouble paying three premiums to three plans, and all too often they find a decent Medigap plan unaffordable. For these retirees (about one in every four Medicare beneficiaries) Medicare Advantage plans have been a godsend. They have been able to enroll in comprehensive health plans that resemble the coverage many nonseniors have—often with no extra premium.

The hostility of the White House and many congressional Democrats toward these health plans is hard to explain. Ostensibly, they do everything President Obama says he wants to accomplish with health reform. They provide subsidized coverage to low- and moderate-income people who could otherwise not afford it. They have no pre-existing condition limitations, and some plans actually specialize in attracting and caring for patients with multiple illnesses. They provide an annual choice of plans.

On measures of quality and efficiency, they also score well. According to a study published in June by America's Health Insurance Plans (a trade group that represents Medicare Advantage insurers):

- Medicare Advantage enrollees had 33% more doctor visits (presumably representing more primary care), yet experienced 18% fewer hospital days and 10% fewer hospital admissions than conventional Medicare patients.
- They had 27% fewer emergency-room visits, 13% fewer avoidable admissions, and 42% fewer readmissions.

Other studies report similarly impressive results.

This is not to say that the Medicare Advantage programs could not be improved. Right now, almost all the enrollees are in HMOs. Very few have a health savings account plan. And there is no practical way for the chronically ill to manage their own budgets. By contrast, the Medicaid disabled—as part of pilot programs that have been in force for a decade—can hire and fire the people who provide them with services, and use any money they save to purchase other medical care.

Some complain that the government has been paying Medicare Advantage plans about 13% more than what would have been spent under conventional Medicare. This is partly explained by the influence of members of Congress who represent rural areas that would not otherwise be able to support these plans. In any event, these "overpayments" allow members to get about \$825 in extra benefits each year, including lower out-of-pocket payments and better coverage for drugs, preventive care, and chronic disease care.

According to a report published in April by the administration's own Medicare Office of the Actuary, about 7.4 million people who would have been enrolled in Medicare Advantage plans in 2017 will lose their coverage completely. Those who are able to retain their coverage will lose significant benefits. These cuts are financing lavish subsidies for health insurance for young people at about the same income level as the seniors who are being penalized.

To those economic libertarians who view this as an entitlement wash, don't be misled. Many of the seniors losing their health plans will enroll in taxpayer-funded Medicaid, in addition to Medicare. The rest will be on the steps of Capitol Hill in the near future asking to have their benefits reinstated.

Mr. Goodman is president, CEO and a fellow at the National Center for Policy Analysis.

The Tea Party and Its Demons
2:19

Opinion Journal: Breakfast with Mahmoud
4:17

Opinion Journal: How to Elect Tax-cutters
10:16

More in Opinion

- [Rove: Democrats Run From Pelosi](#)
- [Stephens: Breakfast With Ahmadinejad](#)
- [John C. Goodman: How Seniors Will Pay for ObamaCare](#)
- [Too Little Inflation?](#)
- [Shakedown in the Rain Forest](#)

Most Popular

Read | Emailed | Video | Commented | Searches

- [Opinion: Fund: The Carter-Obama Comparisons Grow](#)
- [Guys Crash Road Races for Women](#)
- [RIM Readies Its Answer to iPad](#)
- [Opinion: Bruce Ackerman: Obama, Warren and the Imperial Presidency](#)
- [Snakes on a Plane? Try on Your Toilet](#)

Most Read Articles Feed

Latest Headlines

- [Exodus Could Shift White House Tone](#)
- [GOP Halts Repeal of 'Don't Ask, Don't Tell'](#)
- [Obama Dares Foes to Hobble Health Law](#)
- [Two BP Workers Hospitalized](#)
- [New Dinosaur Species Found](#)
- [Pilots, Controllers to Share Safety Data](#)
- [Fla. Court Rejects Ban on Gay Adoption](#)
- [Some Medicare Rate Hikes Denied](#)
- [Egg Company Owner Apologizes As Lawmakers Examine Outbreak](#)
- [Regulators, Oil Firms in Uneasy Alliance](#)

More Headlines

MORE IN OPINION

✉ Email | 🖨 Printer Friendly | 📄 Order Reprints

Tools Sponsor:  TRY EMAIL MARKETING FREE FOR 60 DAYS!

Like 74 people like this. Be the first of your friends.

Share:            

Save on Medicare Plans

Compare All Medicare Plans in Your State. Start Saving Money Now!
www.PlanPrescriber.com

AARP® 50+ Auto Insurance

Over 50? Save an Avg \$397*. 9 out of 10 AARP Policyholder's saved.
AARP.TheHartford.com

Lose Weight with Quaker®

Quaker® Has the Taste You Want Find out more here on our page!
www.Facebook.com/Quaker

Add a Comment

JOURNAL COMMUNITY

We welcome your thoughtful comments. Please comply with our **Community rules**.
All comments will display your real name.

Want to participate in the discussion?

REGISTER FOR FREE

Or log in or become a subscriber now for complete Journal access.

Track replies to my comment

[Go to Comments tab](#)

CLEAR

POST

Related Stories

Breakfast With Ahmadinejad 11 hrs ago

A Teacher Quality Manifesto
Yesterday 12:01 A.M.

Obama, Warren and The Imperial Presidency Yesterday 12:01 A.M.

How ObamaCare Guts Medicare 9/9/2010

Democrats Run From Pelosi 11 hrs ago

Prince Andrew's Peril Yesterday 12:01 A.M.

The Real Gulf Disaster 11 hrs ago

GOP, Tea Party Unity Spells Defeat For Obama 9/21/2010

Related Videos



19 hrs ago
PM Report: China's Muscle-Flexing Prompts Pushback



19 hrs ago
Comparisons Drawn Between Carter and Obama



Yesterday 09:08 A.M.
AM Report: Obama's Economic Czar Plans to Depart

WSJ.com Expand your access to WSJ.com

It only takes a moment

Click here to unlock your **FREE** access to more newsletters, alerts and key analysis

CLICK HERE

Editors' Picks



Flying Home for the Holidays? Book Now



Tobacco Firms Draw Scrutiny on Cigars



'American Idol' Judges: Jennifer Lopez, Steven Tyler Join Show



Ad Chief Crowned Hotel Queen



New Dinosaur Species Found

[BACK TO TOP](#)

- Subscriber Billing Info
- Create an Account:**
- Register for Free
- Subscribe to WSJ.com
- Sign up for WSJ Professional
- Help & Information Center:**
- Help
- Customer Service
- Contact Us
- New on WSJ.com
- Tour the new Journal

- Advertising
- Advertise Locally
- Conferences
- About Dow Jones
- Privacy Policy - Updated
- Subscriber Agreement & Terms of Use - Updated
- Copyright Policy
- Jobs at WSJ.com

- Home
- World
- U.S.
- New York
- Business
- Markets
- Market Data
- Tech
- Personal Finance
- Life & Culture
- Opinion
- Autos
- Careers
- Real Estate
- Small Business
- Student Journal
- Corrections

- Video Center
- Graphics
- Columns
- Blogs
- Topics
- Guides
- Alerts
- New sletters
- Mobile
- iPad
- Podcasts
- RSS Feeds
- Journal Community
- WSJ on Tw itter
- WSJ on Facebook
- WSJ on Foursquare
- My Journal
- Portfolio

- WSJ.com
- Marketw atch.com
- Barrons.com
- SmartMoney.com
- AllThingsD.com
- Finance Jobs at FINN
- BigCharts.com
- Virtual Stock Exchange
- ProfessorJournal.com
- WSJ U.S. Edition
- WSJ Asia Edition
- WSJ Europe Edition
- WSJ India Page
- Foreign Language Editions:
- WSJ Chinese
- WSJ Japanese
- WSJ Portuguese
- WSJ Spanish

Copyright ©2010 Dow Jones & Company, Inc. All Rights Reserved

